

REVIEWS

(social historians will be interested in Madden's work on purveyance) as well as those studying warfare in Europe during the Middle Ages.

SIMON EGAN
University of Glasgow, UK

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.25602/GOLD.bjmh.v5i1.824>

Arran Johnston, *On Gladsmuir Shall the Battle Be! The Battle of Prestonpans 1745*. Solihull: Helion & Company Ltd, 2017. Xviii+226pp. ISBN 978-1-911512-83-7 (hardback). Price £25.

The battle of Prestonpans is well enough known as the first major encounter of the Jacobite Rising of 1745. It is usually addressed - quite often in some detail - in histories of the Rising, but it is very much rarer for it to enjoy a book-length study, as it was only temporarily decisive and the scale of the victory it represented is diminished by the conclusion of the Rising of 1745 in the overwhelming and decisive defeat of Culloden, adopted by British historiography as a foundational battle in the history of the British Empire and the rise of the United Kingdom to global prominence.

How then does Arran Johnston justify a 250 page study of the fight at Prestonpans, where fewer than 5000 troops were involved on both sides? Shrewdly, he rests his case on the view that without a Jacobite victory at Prestonpans the significance of the '45 would be as a footnote in history, something analogous to Glenshiel in 1719. He points out also the sense - from which the early title 'Gladsmuir' derived - of the battle as a fulfillment of Scottish historical prophecy.

There is much to commend in this study. The welcome use of the title 'British Army' to describe Cope's forces is completely correct and overdue: British regulars are still exposed to being called 'Government' troops or even worse 'Hanoverian' ones in this one context alone. This detaches them from their role, and their link - especially later in the campaign - to George II's personal leadership at Dettingen, and to the Continental firefights of the War of the Austrian Succession in which many of them had been involved. The '45 was an existential threat to the British state, which defended itself using - not solely, but centrally - the British Army.

Johnston's historical geography - the approach to Prestonpans, the sense of its status as an industrial site even in 1745 and at 'the cutting edge of Scotland's agricultural and industrial revolutions' (p. 38) - is very detailed and draws the reader in to both the age

REVIEWS

and the place powerfully. The family and military background of John Cope is explored in detail, as is that of Charles Edward. Familiar ground is trodden in reciting the journey to Scotland in 1745, the Seven Men of Moidart and so forth, and - because quite traditional historiographical paradigms about the 'Highland army' and the expedition are on show, there is a sense here of padding: do we really need a full narrative of the 'Forty-five every time one of its elements is studied? The basics are readily available online, often it is true in a misleading historiographical format, but then there is nothing new on show here. Frank McLynn's *France and the Jacobite Rising of 1745* (1981) remains unanswered in its demonstration of the extent and partial sincerity of the potential French commitment, but the book does not appear in the bibliography, nor does much else pertinent to the modern historiography of the Rising. The sources for this central section are a mixture of primary material, clan histories and elderly secondary texts. Key questions, such as the reason for the opening of the Netherbow Port in Edinburgh, are elided as a 'mystery'. The collusion of the Lord Provost - widely suspected, but never proved in law - is an interesting question, and one which would bear fuller revisiting if - as Johnston does - more than 80 pages is to be spent on the campaign prior to the battle. There are only seven or eight modern secondary studies relating to Jacobitism in the bibliography.

Johnston does give full weight to the presence of Jacobite firearms at the battle, though is perhaps rather ready to assume that Morier and the Penicuik sketches have no hint of propaganda or caricature about them. Prestonpans does appear to have been the last engagement at which Lochaber axes were used, and this is discussed. The geography of the field itself is laid out in painstaking and precise detail, and is some of the very best study of the battle available, while the stress on the 'day one' conflict on 20 September is also excellent.

The implications of the military nature of the engagement are detailed, but perhaps explored to a little less depth than the field itself. The narrow Jacobite column (p. 157) was in keeping with French deployment, while the premature deployment of the dragoons, repeated at Falkirk and based on assumptions about Jacobite vulnerability to cavalry, was a tactical mistake which Cumberland (or Bland) corrected at Culloden, to devastating effect. The account of the collapse of Cope's line and artillery is well done, though it is worth noting that the British Army firing system under the 1727 regulations could not cope with rapid advance in a narrow fronted column: it failed to cope at Falkirk, and was changed for Culloden and in the 1748 Regulations. Closer examination of weapons systems, tactics and drill in action might have given even greater depth to Johnston's account here.

Both the aftermath and memorialization of the battle are well covered. Arran Johnston has produced the fullest and most detailed study yet of Prestonpans, and for that

REVIEWS

reason alone this book is worth having on the shelves of anyone interested in the Jacobite movement.

MURRAY PITTOCK
University of Glasgow, UK

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.25602/GOLD.bjmh.v5i1.831>

Robert A. Geake with Lorin M. Spears, *From Slaves to Soldiers: the 1st Rhode Island Regiment in the American Revolution*. Yardley, PA: Westholme Publishing, 2016. 184pp. ISBN 97-8159-4162-688 (hardback). £19.99.

Books, articles, monuments, and oral testimonies about The First Rhode Island Regiment, reorganized deep into the long American Revolution as the so-called 'Black Regiment', have attracted attention since abolitionists in the 1850s touted the valour of free blacks and former slaves in fighting against the British. A century later, Lorenzo Greene and Benjamin Quarles began to thicken the story of the Black Regiment. Now, in the last two decades, spurred by the Rhode Island Black Heritage Society and also by the efforts of white military historians, a clutch of new books and essays have presented new accounts of the integrated and then segregated First Rhode Island Regiment. The book under review here is the latest entry into what has become a controversial chapter of American military history.

Episodic and sparsely footnoted, *From Slaves to Soldiers* leaves the reader unaware of much of the First Regiment's history. For example, in Chapter 2, while diverting the reader with descriptions of the Stono Rebellion in South Carolina in 1739, the authors provide only the sketchiest details in the status and backgrounds of the Narragansett and other indigenous people recruited for the First Rhode Island Regiment after the Rhode Island Assembly reconstituted it in January 1778 by offering compensation to masters willing to free their slaves. One learns only that they were drawn from 'remaining indigenous people [who] were enslaved, indentured, or displaced from their traditional villages' (pp. 42-43). Also ignored is the enlistment of free blacks and indigenous males in the two years *before* the formation of the Black Regiment. Far from 'just a few blacks being integrated into a handful of regiments' in Washington's Continental Army, some fifty to seventy-five men of colour were among about five hundred rank and file soldiers in Rhode Island First and Second regiments that fought from Bunker Hill to Red Bank to Monmouth Courthouse from 1775 to 1777,